Criteria for Evaluating Reasoning

1. Purpose
   What is the purpose of the writer? Is the purpose clearly stated or clearly implied? Is it justifiable?

2. Question
   Is the question at issue well-stated? Is it clear and unbiased? Does the expression of the question do justice to the complexity of the matter at issue?

3. Information
   Does the writer cite relevant evidence, experiences, and/or information essential to the issue? Is the information accurate?

4. Concepts
   Does the writer clarify key concepts when necessary?

5. Assumptions
   Does the writer show a sensitivity to what he or she is taking for granted or assuming? Does the writer use questionable assumptions without addressing problems which might be inherent in those assumptions?

6. Inferences
   Does the writer develop a line of reasoning explaining well how she or he arrived at his or her main conclusions?

7. Point of View
   Does the writer show sensitivity to alternative relevant points of view or lines of reasoning? Does s/he consider and respond to objections framed from other relevant points of view?

8. Implications
   Does the writer show sensitivity to the implications and consequences of the position s/he is taking?

---